

City of Tallahassee

Charter Review Committee Minutes

January 16, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on January 16, 2024, at 5:30 p.m. in the DSEM Conference Room, 2nd floor, Renaissance Center.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Sha’Ron James, Elaine Bryant, Bugra Demirel, Beth Corum, Bruce Strouble, Ernie Paine, and Jared Willis; Chantelle Dorsey joined the meeting at 5:50 p.m.

Members Participating Virtually: Howard Kessler

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, Interim City Attorney Amy Toman, Matt Lutz, Angela Ivy, Dominique Robinson

City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke called the Charter Review Committee (CRC) meeting to order at 5:32 p.m. Following introductions of members and staff, Interim City Attorney Toman provided a brief presentation on general city charters and charter review committees including best practices and considerations in the process. Committee discussion included the ability of the City Commission to add items to the ballot without review by a CRC and the importance of public access, either in person or virtually, and citizen input on the process. City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke clarified that virtual access would be dependent on technical capabilities of the meeting location. Interim City Attorney Toman explained that state law and City Policy 108 provided for citizen comment before a committee voted on a measure before them.

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke provided a brief presentation on the CRC bylaws including the specific function outlined therein. He noted that virtual participation did not count toward a quorum and that voting by virtual participants was not permitted. Committee discussion included the ability of Committee members to introduce other issues, reasons behind the restrictions of virtual participation, and procedures to amend the bylaws to consider items beyond the outlined scope. Interim City Attorney Toman explained that state law allows for virtual participation but not to establish a quorum. It also provides for voting virtually; however, the City Commission approved bylaws restrict voting to encourage engagement and attendance.

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke clarified staff’s role in the flow of information between the Committee and the City Commission and stated that any amendments to the bylaws would follow the agenda item and approval process for regular City Commission meetings. However, the City Commission supported a limited scope to keep to the prescribed timeframe to produce a report within 90 days of appointment to the CRC. There was consensus across the Committee to efficiently address Functions 1-4, as outlined in the bylaws, prior to considering amending the bylaws to address additional items.

Ms. Sha’Ron James moved to **elect Mr. Mark Mustian as Chair** of the CRC. Upon second by Mr. Ernie Paine, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof**.

Mr. Bugra Demirel moved to **elect Dr. Elaine Bryant as Vice-Chair** of the CRC. Upon second by Sha’Ron James, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof**.

City Treasure-Clerk Cooke rendered the role of Chair to Mr. Mustian.

Interim City Attorney Toman provided a brief presentation on Ethics, Sunshine Law, and Public Records including individuals covered by the City of Tallahassee Ethics Ordinance; City Policy 110, stating that all citizen advisory boards are subject to the Sunshine Law (Ch. 286, F.S.) and the requirements therein; and the Public Records Act (Ch. 119, F.S.).

Chair Mustian facilitated a discussion on the proposed timeline and schedule for CRC meetings. The Committee came to consensus on Thursday, January 25, and February 1, for the next two meetings and requested that staff poll members availability for the remaining dates through March 12, 2024. Committee discussion included the possibility of holding meetings in various neighborhoods to promote citizen engagement. City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke stated that staff would investigate options, however, the meeting location would be dependent on availability and technical capabilities of the facility.

CRC members requested the following information on Functions 1-2, to facilitate discussions of the first two meetings: Charter Review survey results, census data and number of commissioners per capita of comparable cities, as well as full and part-time salaries of the same, and the decision process used by comparable cities.

Public Comment:

1. Peter Butzin, 2358 Carefree Cove, representing Coalition of Citizens for Ethics Reform, expressed concern for the narrow scope of the CRC stating that Section 134 of the Charter and Section 2B of the 1999 CRC bylaws provided for any amendments to the Charter. He requested that the CRC listen to all citizen concerns on any topic and make a formal report on containing all recommendations deemed appropriate and necessary.
2. Ben Wilcox, representing Coalition of Citizens for Ethics Reform, expressed concern for the lack of public awareness and requested that CRC meetings be included on the City Commission calendar, to publish agendas online prior to the meeting, and to broadcast CRC meetings to encourage public participation in the deliberations of the CRC.

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **broadly notice CRC meeting schedule, prepare a published agenda, and facilitate electronic participation.** Upon second by Dr. Bruce Strouble, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof.**

Ms. Sha'Ron James moved to **include public comment on CRC agenda items.** Upon second by Ms. Beth Corum, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof.**

Mr. Jared Willis moved to request the City Commission to clarify their intent of Function #5, in the bylaws, and the proper procedure to expand the scope of the CRC.

The motion died for lack of second.

The meeting adjourned at 7:25 p.m.

*Member Kessler participated virtually and was unable to cast a vote. The unanimous votes documented herein represent those members present and voting in person.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

January 25, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on January 25, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the Tallahassee Room, 2nd floor, City Hall.

Members Present: Elaine Bryant, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Beth Corum, Bruce Strouble, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Chantelle Dorsey.

Members Absent: Mark Mustian, Howard Kessler

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy, IT Support Analyst David Givens.

Vice Chair Bryant called the Charter Review Committee (CRC) meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. A quorum was present.

Approval of Minutes

Beth Corum moved to **approve the January 16, 2024, CRC minutes**. Upon second by Chantelle Dorsey, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof**.

Charter Presentation by Florida League of Cities

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke introduced Ms. Lynn Tipton, Director of Florida League of Cities University, provided a brief presentation on municipal charters in Florida including the history, purpose, common elements and characteristics, forms of municipal government, comparisons to other Florida cities, best practices, and trends.

Public Comment:

- Stanley Sims, 1320 Avondale Way, inquired about the qualifications of CRC members and potential conflicts of interest.
- Ben Wilcox, President, Citizens Coalition for Ethics Reform, thanked staff for the materials provided, and requested that “public comments” be listed on future CRC agendas.

Function 1: Number of Electors (Charter, Sec. 9)

Public Comment:

- Stanley Sims, 1320 Avondale Way, to express concern about diversity and representation on the City Commission, recommended implementing districts and at-large seats, similar to the Leon County Board of County Commissioners (BOCC).
- Will Crowley, address not provided, to express opposition to expanding the size of the Commission and opposition to creating single-member districts.
- Margret Moore, 1910 Monticello Dr., to express concern with the cottage industries that surround political campaigns and expressed opposition to expanding the size of the City Commission.
- Adner Marcelin, 122 S. Calhoun St., to express concern with the Charter review moving forward with minimal public input and encouraged the CRC to personally engage citizens and solicit community feedback before recommending any changes.

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **direct the City to provide additional options for public comment.** Upon second by Ms. Sharon James, the vote was **unanimous in favor thereof.**

The Committee discussed the process for receiving public comment, deliberation, and the timing of a vote on each function. City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke indicated the Office of the Treasurer-Clerk would serve as a conduit for public comment and staff would make the several emails recently received part of the official record of the committee's activities.

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **deliberate items on the date agendaed and set a time-certain for the final vote at the end of the discussion.** Ms. Beth Corum seconded the motion. Following Committee discussion, City Attorney Toman confirmed that process and noted that while Florida law required bodies to take public comment ahead of a vote, it was not necessary for input to be taken at the same meeting where the final action occurs. **Mr. Jared Willis withdrew his motion. Ms. Beth Corum withdrew her second.**

The Committee agreed that the vote on Functions 1 and 2 (Size of the Governing Body and Salaries), would occur not sooner than Feb. 8, 2024.

Regarding Function 1, the Committee discussed various factors in considering the size of the City Commission including population, magnitude of the city budget, the responsibilities of the Commission, and the importance of balanced representation reflective of local demographics and the complexities of Tallahassee.

Public Comment – continued:

- Will Crowley, address not provided, to express frustration with the influence of financial contributions which he believed served to silence grassroots, community led efforts to effect change.
- Stanley Sims, 1320 Avondale Way, to express his uncertainty for the appropriate size of the City Commission, and expressed his desire for an efficient body that would address unethical and unprofessional activities in city government.
- Kristellys Estanga, 308 N Dellview Dr., to express frustration with the City Commission history of taking public comment but voting against initiatives proposed by citizens.

Function 2: Commission Compensation (Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment:

- Margaret Moore, 1910 Monticello Dr., to express support for raising salaries for the four Commission seats to be similar to that of the mayor and county commissioners.

Regarding Function 2, the committee discussed the history and rationale of current city commission salaries, the state statute which governs county commissioners' pay, as well as the workload, demands, and time expectations for city commissioners; challenges in attracting passionate, qualified candidates to run for office with the existing compensation; and clarifying the purpose of the compensation as either a living wage or for the time commitment expected of commissioners to represent their constituency.

Public Comment – continued:

- Adner Marcelin, 122 S. Calhoun St., to request clarification if the position of city commissioner was full- or part-time employment, cost of living versus merit increases, and the impact on other City employees whose compensation was comparable to or less than a commissioner.
- Stanley Sims, 1320 Avondale Way, to express that compensation should be clarified in ordinance rather than the Charter and encourage an external analysis of compensation every four years plus consideration for other City employees' salaries.
- Margaret Moore, 1910 Monticello Dr., to suggest that compensation be based on annual financial disclosure filings (i.e. different salaries for each commissioner based on wealth), and consider outside employment plus the level of involvement in the community by the Commissioner.
- Will Crowley, address not provided, to express support for increasing Commissioner compensation to encourage the average person to run for office.

CRC members requested the following information to further facilitate deliberations and increase citizen participation: provide an online portal for citizens to submit input to the CRC, correct Webex connectivity issues, provide information on the models implemented by other cities regarding elected officials' compensation, research the County Charter to determine if it declares county commissioners as full or part time, provide the median and mean salary of fulltime city employees, and investigate the possibility of a live broadcasting option of future CRC meetings.

Ms. Beth Corum moved to **receive public comment on Functions 1 & 2 and vote no sooner than Feb. 8, 2024**. Upon second by Mr. Jared Willis, the vote on the motion was **unanimous in favor thereof**.

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **agenda Functions 3 & 4 for the Feb. 1, 2024, meeting**. Upon second by Mr. Jared Willis, the vote on the motion was **unanimous in favor thereof**.

The meeting adjourned at 8:18 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

February 1, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on February 1, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the Tallahassee Room, 2nd floor, City Hall.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Elaine Bryant, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Beth Corum, Bruce Strouble, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Chantelle Dorsey, Howard Kessler

A quorum was present.

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy, IT Support Analyst David Givens.

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Grace Dansby
2. Matthew Vargas
3. K. Lennorris Barber
4. Stanley Sims
5. Hon. Dot Inman-Johnson

Approval of Minutes

Ernie Paine moved to approve the January 25, 2024, CRC minutes. Upon second by Elaine Bryant, the vote was unanimous in favor thereof.

Meeting Schedule

Chair Mustian polled the Committee for possible future meeting dates and requested staff to confirm availability and to consider alternative meeting locations in different areas of the city.

Function 1: Size of the Governing Body (Charter, Sec. 9)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. Ahad Mohika
3. Colton Taylor
4. Hon. Dot Inman-Johnson

Chair Mustian clarified that single-member districts were not included in the scope of bylaws approved by the City Commission, only the size of the governing body. Mr. Mustian inquired if additional information was needed regarding the size of the city commission and staff noted the committee members' requests.

Function 2: Commission Compensation (Charter Sec. 340 / Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment – There were no speakers.

Chair Mustian facilitated a discussion regarding City Commission pay and compensation. Staff noted requests for additional data.

Discussion ensued regarding pay and compensation.

Function 3: Method of Election – Primary Elections (Charter Sec. 120)

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke presented the item and answered the Committee's questions relative thereto.

Public Comment

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Adner Marcelin
2. Stanley Sims
3. Hon. Dot Inman-Johnson
4. Serenity Williams
5. Stanley Sims
6. Adner Marcelin
7. Louis Dilbert
8. Colton Taylor

Chair Mustian inquired if the committee needed any further information regarding the Method of Election/Primaries item, and staff noted requests for additional data. Committee discussion included discussion of the other non-partisan races shown on the August ballot, potential for a "lame duck" period following a city primary, voter turnout at the various elections, logistical challenges, and improving voter participation in all elections, plus the reason why Leon County chose to list 2-person county commission races on the general election ballot vs. the primary ballot.

Mr. Chris Moore, Deputy Supervisor of Elections for Leon County, confirmed that county commission seats are non-partisan in nature, and he noted that the county charter sent 2-person county commission races to the general election ballot as that election had the highest voter turnout.

Chair Mustian confirmed that the next meeting would be held on Thursday, February 8, 2024, at 6:00 pm in the Tallahassee Room.

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke confirmed the material requested by members of the Committee including City Commission pay & benefits package, liability insurance related to the mayor, a

comprehensive table of salary and government structure for peer cities, and identifying alternative locations to hold future CRC meetings at other facilities equipped with technological features on par with the Tallahassee Room.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

February 8, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on February 8, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the Tallahassee Room, 2nd floor, City Hall.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Beth Corum, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Chantelle Dorsey, Howard Kessler

A quorum was present.

Dr. Bruce Strouble arrived at 6:02.

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy.

OPENING BUSINESS

Item 2: Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Emily Fritz
2. Steve Butzin
3. Stanley Sims
4. Will Crowley
5. Debbie Lightsey

Item 3: Approval of Minutes

Jared Willis moved to approve the February 1, 2024, CRC minutes. Upon second by Howard Kessler, the vote was unanimous in favor thereof.

NEW BUSINESS

Item 4: Meeting Schedule

City Treasurer-Clerk clarified the timeframe required to obtain City Commission approval and meeting the June 1 deadline to submit ballot language to the Leon County Supervisor of Elections office. Chair Mustian clarified that the Committee would meet the defined scope before any additional topics would be considered in the review.

Jared Willis moved to affirm polled dates (Feb. 15, 20, 29 and Mar. 7) and adjust as necessary going forward. Upon second by Beth Corum, the vote was unanimous in favor thereof.

Item 5: Function 4: Periodic Charter Review Requirement (Charter Sec. 134)

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke presented the item and answered the Committee’s questions relative thereto.

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson

Commissioner Elaine Bryant arrived at 6:47 p.m.

Committee discussion ensued regarding a periodic review of the Charter including the frequency of the process, the benefits and challenges of aligning the City’s Charter review to coincide with the County’s plus offsetting it by two or four years, and potential language such as “no less/more than” to frame the rate of recurrence.

OLD BUSINESS

Item 6: Function 1: Size of the Governing Body (Charter, Sec. 9)

Public Comment – There were no speakers.

Chair Mustian inquired if additional information was needed regarding the size of the city commission and staff noted the committee members’ requests.

Discussion ensued regarding criteria for determining the size of the Commission including population, demographics, representation of County residents on City utilities, annexations, and the effects of Function 4: Periodic Charter Review Requirements on the size of the Commission.

Item 7: Function 2: Commission Compensation (Charter Sec. 340 / Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
3. Steve Martin

Chair Mustian inquired if additional information was needed regarding Commission compensation and staff noted the committee members’ requests.

Discussion ensued regarding Commission compensation including hourly requirements versus opinions and capacities of individual Commissioners, hiring an independent consultant to evaluate compensation, Commissioners other, often full-time jobs, the formula used to determine City Commissioner salaries, and removing compensation from the Charter to have it instead set by ordinance or resolution.

Item 8: Function 3: Method of Election – Primary Elections (Charter Sec. 120)

Due to the time, this item was tabled for the February 15, 2024, meeting.

Chair Mustian confirmed that the Committee would likely vote on three of the four functions at the February 20, 2024, CRC meeting.

Summary of additional information requested by the Committee: visual data, map, and presentation from the Leon County Supervisor of Elections Office regarding voter turnout by precinct, partisan participation of all parties, and demographics for primary and general elections; and the median and mean income for City residents.

Due to the time, the meeting adjourned at 8:02 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

February 15, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on February 15, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the Tallahassee Room, 2nd floor, City Hall.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Howard Kessler, Elaine Bryant

A quorum was present.

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy

OPENING BUSINESS

Item 2: Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Emily Fritz
2. Stanley Sims
3. Richard Darabi
4. Jeremy Cohen

Item 3: Approval of Minutes

Howard Kessler moved to approve the February 8, 2024, CRC minutes. Upon second by Jared Willis, the vote was unanimous in favor thereof.

OLD BUSINESS

Item 4: Function 3: Method of Election – Primary Elections (Charter Sec. 120)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims

No additional information was requested by the Committee regarding Function 3.

Committee discussion ensued regarding the method of elections around data provided by the Leon County Supervisor of Elections Office which indicated significantly greater voter turnout at general elections compared to primaries.

Item 5: Function 4: Periodic Charter Review Requirement (Charter Sec. 134)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. K. Lennorris Barber

No additional information was requested by the Committee regarding Function 4.

Committee discussion ensued regarding a periodic review of the Charter including offsetting a City Charter Review from the years of a County Charter Review, recommendations of a timeframe for the review, and the length of the review process.

The Committee requested staff to craft a motion for the CRC to consider at the February 20, 2024, meeting.

Commissioner Elaine Bryant departed the meeting at 6:45 p.m.

Item 6: Function 1: Size of the Governing Body (Charter, Sec. 9)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. K. Lennorris Barber
3. Matt Isbell

No additional information was requested by the Committee regarding Function 1.

Discussion ensued regarding criteria for determining the size of the Commission including voter participation, future annexations and demographics to ensure equitable representation, and the preference for input from community organizations.

Dr. Bruce Strouble joined the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

Item 7: Function 2: Commission Compensation (Charter Sec. 340 / Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. Steve Martin

Chair Mustian inquired if additional information was needed regarding Commission compensation and staff noted the committee members' requests.

Discussion ensued regarding Commission compensation including quantifiable metrics of full time or part time versus community expectations of electeds, separation of comparison from constitutional officers and executive roles, and process to determine a fair formula of compensation.

Ms. Chantelle Dorsey joined the meeting at 7:39 p.m.

Chair Mustian noted the remaining meeting schedule and proposed a procedural process to support the Committee in meeting their objectives including a framework for voting at the February 20, 2024, CRC meeting and presenting additional items for Committee consideration.

Summary of additional information requested by the Committee: draft motions for Committee consideration, security data for badge swipes by Commissioners, volume of entries on Commission calendars, volume of emails received by Commission offices, information Commission office structure including Aides, total compensation data in quantifiable numbers, and general budget information by Commission offices.

The meeting adjourned at 7:57 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

February 20, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on February 20, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the DSEM Conference Room, 2nd floor, Renaissance Center.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Howard Kessler, Elaine Bryant, Chantelle Dorsey, Bruce Strouble, Beth Corum

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy

OPENING BUSINESS

Item 2: Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Steve Martin
2. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
3. Stanley Sims
4. Will Crowley
5. John Hedrick

Item 3: Approval of Minutes

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **approve the February 15, 2024, CRC minutes**. Upon second by Dr. Elaine Bryant, **the vote was unanimous in favor thereof**.

OLD BUSINESS

Item 4: Function 3: Method of Election – Primary Elections (Charter Sec. 120)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
2. John Hedrick

Mr. Bugra Demirel moved to **recommend placing contested races with two-candidates directly on the general election ballot in November**. Upon second by Mr. Jared Willis, the vote was as follows:

AYE: Mark Mustian, Elaine Bryant, Beth Corum, Bugra Demirel, Sha’Ron James, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis

NAY: Chantelle Dorsey, Howard Kessler, Bruce Strouble

The motion passed.

Item 5: Function 4: Periodic Charter Review Requirement (Charter Sec. 134)

Public Comment: There were no speakers.

Mr. Howard Kessler moved to **recommend a review of the City Charter in six years (2030), with the Review Committee convened in June of the preceding year, and with regular reviews of the City Charter every eight years thereafter.** Upon second by Dr. Bruce Strouble, the **vote on the motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

Item 6: Function 1: Size of the Governing Body (Charter, Sec. 9)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
2. John Hedrick
3. Stanley Sims
4. Serenity Williams

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **recommend maintaining the number of electors at five.** Dr. Bruce Strouble provided the second.

Mr. Bugra Demirel offered a **substitute motion to table the vote on Function 1 until the Feb. 29, 2024, meeting.** Upon second by Jared Willis the vote on the substitute motion was as follows:

AYE: Bugra Demirel, Jared Willis, Beth Corum

NAY: Mark Mustian, Elaine Bryant, Chantelle Dorsey, Sha’Ron James, Howard Kessler, Ernie Paine, Bruce Strouble

The motion failed.

The vote on the original motion was as follows:

AYE: Mark Mustian, Elaine Bryant, Sha’Ron James, Bruce Strouble, Ernie Paine, Howard Kessler, Chantelle Dorsey, Bugra Demirel

NAY: Jared Willis, Beth Corum

The motion passed.

In the spirit of collegiality, Ms. Beth Corum offered support of maintaining the number of electors at five.

Item 7: Function 2: Commission Compensation (Charter Sec. 340 / Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to the item:

1. Stanley Sims
2. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
3. Jack Hedrick
4. Steve Martin

Dr. Bruce Strouble moved to **recommend increasing Commissioner compensation**. Upon second by Dr. Elaine Bryant, the vote on the motion was as follows:

AYE: Bruce Strouble, Elaine Bryant, Bugra Demirel, Jared Willis, Sha’Ron James, Ernie Paine, Chantelle Dorsey, Beth Corum Howard Kessler,

NAY: Mark Mustian

The motion passed.

Committee discussion ensued regarding different percentages based on the Board of County Commissioners salaries, using a formula based on CPI, moving compensation out of the Charter and for it to be set by Ordinance, conducting an independent compensation study, or a hybrid of these options in order for the Committee to suggest an amount for the recommended compensation increase including requesting staff to draft recommendations that would provide a framework for discussion at the February 29, 2024, CRC meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee relative to new proposals to consider in the Charter Review:

1. Chris Moore, Leon County Deputy Supervisor of Elections, to clarify single issue language on the general ballot
2. Will Crowley, to request consideration regarding the sale of public assets
3. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson, to request concise and simple to understand language on any ballot initiative.
4. Serenity Williams, to request consideration of the Police Chief as an Appointed Official reporting to the City Commission.

Committee members proposed additional items to consider including expanding the role and duties of the Independent Ethics Board to cover whistleblower protection at a Commission level and to extend the City's Code of Ethics to Commissioners serving on joint boards or agencies, reclassifying the Police Chief position to that of an Appointed Official, and establishing single member districts within the current number of electors.

Summary of additional information requested by the Committee: draft language for possible compensation recommendations, the agenda material from the January 2022, City Commission agenda material regarding the IEB, and a letter from the IEB to the City Commission regarding whistleblower complaints.

The meeting adjourned at 8:27 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

February 29, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on February 29, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. at the Smith Williams Service Center.

Members Present: Mark Mustian, Sha’Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Howard Kessler, Elaine Bryant, Chantelle Dorsey, Bruce Strouble

Members Absent: Beth Corum

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy

OPENING BUSINESS

Item 2: Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Peter Butzin
2. John Hedrick
3. Will Crowley
4. Erwin Jackson
5. Dwight Floyd, Executive Director, Independent Ethics Board
6. John Reed, Legal Counsel, Independent Ethics Board
7. Hon. Dot Inman Johnson
8. Stanley Sims

OLD BUSINESS

Item 4: Function 2: Commission Compensation (Charter Sec. 340 / Related Laws Sec. 1-1)

Public Comment: There were no speakers.

Dr. Bruce Strouble moved to **recommend compensation development as set forth in Model E**. Ms. Chantelle Dorsey provided the second.

Following Committee discussion, Dr. Strouble **withdrew the motion**, stating that it was less clear than his original understanding.

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **recommend compensation development as set forth in Models A-F for City Commission consideration**.

The **motion died** for lack of a second.

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **bring back sample ballot language for present to the City Commission and public**. Dr. Bruce Strouble provided a second.

Mr. Bugra Demirel offered a substitute motion to **bring back sample ballot language for compensation development as set forth in Models A, E, and F**. Upon second by Mr. Jared Willis, the vote on the motion was as follows:

AYE: Elaine Bryant, Bugra Demirel, Jared Willis, Bruce Strouble, Sha’Ron James, Ernie Paine, Chantelle Dorsey

NAY: Mark Mustian, Howard Kessler

The motion passed.

NEW BUSINESS – ADDITIONAL PROPOSALS

Public Comment: There were no speakers.

Expanding the Duties of the Independent Ethics Board (IEB)

Mr. Ernie Paine provided a brief presentation on the subject areas within the proposal, including extending investigative authority to the IEB for whistleblower complaints outside of the Inspector General’s jurisdiction and to expand the IEB’s jurisdiction to include City Commissioners serving on board of joint agencies, such as Blueprint Intergovernmental Agency and the Community Redevelopment Agency. Mr. Paine noted that material related to the proposal was included in the meeting materials, based on prior request to staff, as well as draft Charter amendment language distributed at the meeting. (A copy of the draft Charter language is on file with the City Treasurer-Clerk’s Office.)

Police Chief as an Appointed Official

Dr. Bruce Strouble provided a brief presentation for amending Section 136 of the City Charter to support the reclassification of the position of the Police Chief to that of an Appointed Official. Dr. Strouble noted that he emailed staff a request for additional information on the proposal.

Redistricting / Single Member Districts

Mr. Jared Willis provided a brief presentation for redistricting and establishing single member districts within the current number of electors including a map he provided to support the proposal. (A copy of the map is on file with the City Treasurer-Clerk’s Office.)

Summary of additional information requested by the Committee: additional information on the duties of the IEB, staff input on draft Charter amendments, information regarding reclassifying

the Police Chief's position to an Appointed Official, information on how single member districts could be implemented.

The meeting adjourned at 8:09 p.m.

City of Tallahassee Charter Review Committee Minutes

March 7, 2024

The Charter Review Committee met on March 7, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. at City Hall in the Tallahassee Room.

Members Present: Elaine Bryant Sha'Ron James, Bugra Demirel, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis; Howard Kessler, Chantelle Dorsey, Bruce Strouble, Beth Corum

Members Absent: Mark Mustian

Staff Present: City Treasurer-Clerk Jim Cooke, City Attorney Amy Toman, Records Administrator Matt Lutz, Meeting Coordinator Angela Ivy

OPENING BUSINESS

Item 2: Public Comment:

The following person(s) addressed the Committee:

1. Peter Butzin
2. Matthew Isbell
3. John Hedrick
4. Stanley Sims
5. Shirley Zahn
6. Dwight Floyd, Executive Director, Independent Ethics Board

Item 3: Approval of Minutes

Mr. Jared Willis moved **approval of the February 20 and February 29, 2024 minutes**. Upon second by Mr. Howard Kessler, the **vote on the motion passed unanimously**.

The motion passed.

NEW BUSINESS

Item 4: Draft Final Report

City Treasurer-Clerk Cooke presented the items and answered the Committees questions relative thereto.

The committee directed staff to note in the final report, relative to the City Commission compensation (Function 2), that the Committee voted to recommend an increase in City Commission salaries.

Mr. Cooke advised the Committee that the Final Report would be completed by staff, memorializing the Committee's decisions relative to Function 2 and additional proposals, if any,

after the conclusion of the present meeting. In addition, Mr. Cooke explained that Chairman Mustian would work with the City Treasurer-Clerk on completion of the report, and that Mr. Mustian would be present on March 27th to deliver the report to the City Commission at its regular meeting on that date.

OLD BUSINESS

Item 5: Function 2: Commission Compensation

Public Comment: There were no speakers.

Mr. Bugra Demirel moved to **recommend compensation for the Mayor and City Commission equal to that of the Leon County Board of County Commissioners.**

The motion died for lack of second.

Mr. Bugra Demirel moved to **recommend compensation for the Mayor and City Commission be based on Model A.** Upon second by Ms. Sha’Ron James, the vote on the motion was as follows:

Model A – Percentage of County Commission

Sec. 23 – Salaries.

Members of the city commission, other than the mayor, shall be paid an annual salary equal to two-thirds ($\frac{2}{3}$) of the annual salary set by state law for members of the Board of County Commissioners of Leon County, Florida.

The mayor shall be paid an annual salary, which shall be set by ordinance, in an amount which shall not be less than two-thirds ($\frac{2}{3}$) of, but not more than, the annual salary set by state law for members of the Board of County Commissioners of Leon County, Florida.

The salary of a Leon County Commissioner shall be the salary computed pursuant to Ch. 145, Florida Statutes and published by the Office of Economic and Demographic Research.

Salaries shall become effective each October 1st.

Ballot Question

TITLE: City Commission Salaries

Shall city commissioners be paid an annual salary equal to two-thirds ($\frac{2}{3}$) of the annual salary set by state law for members of the Board of County Commissioners of Leon County, Florida, with the salary of the mayor to be established by the City Commission in an amount not less than the salary of a City Commissioner nor more than a County Commissioner?

AYE: Elaine Bryant, Bugra Demirel, Sha’Ron James

NAY: Jared Willis, Ernie Paine, Howard Kessler, Chantelle Dorsey, Bruce Strouble, Beth Corum

The motion failed 3 - 6.

Ms. Sha’Ron James moved to **recommend compensation for the Mayor and City Commission be based on Model F as amended** (underlined below). Upon second by Ms. Chantelle Dorsey, the vote on the motion was as follows:

Model F – Salary Study Committee

Sec. 23 - Salary Study Committee; City Commission Salaries.

The city commission may, at any time deemed advisable, establish a compensation committee of not less than five, nor more than seven, registered electors of the City of Tallahassee to conduct a review and make a written recommendation to the city commission concerning the salaries of the mayor and city commissioners. The committee shall report its finding not later than four (4) months after being appointed.

The city commission, upon the receipt of a report from a compensation committee, may set the annual salaries of the mayor and city commissioners by ordinance. Any ordinance amending salaries shall become effective on the date of commencement of the terms of office of the members elected at the next regular municipal election which follows the adoption of such ordinance by at least six (6) months.

Ballot Question

TITLE: City Commission Salaries

Shall the salaries of the mayor and city commissioners be established, by ordinance, after a review and recommendation by a salary study committee, provided that any ordinance amending salaries shall not take effect until the next regular municipal election held at least six (6) months thereafter?

AYE: Elaine Bryant, Sha’Ron James, Chantelle Dorsey, Bruce Strouble, Beth Corum, Ernie Paine, Jared Willis

NAY: Bugra Demirel, Howard Kessler

The motion passed 7 - 2.

Item 6: Additional Proposals

Public Comment: There were no speakers.

Duties of the Independent Ethics Board (IEB)

Mr. Ernie Paine presented the item.

During discussion, City Inspector-General/City Auditor Dennis Sutton and City Ethics Officer Dwight Floyd came forward and answered the Committee's questions relative thereto.

After discussion, Mr. Paine moved to **recommend a Charter amendment that the Independent Ethics Board be designated by the City Commission as the "appropriate local official" with the authority to receive and investigate complaints and disclosures under F.S. 112.3187, as it may be amended from time to time, when such complaints or disclosures name the mayor or their staff, the commissioners or their staff, or the Inspector General or their staff, and allege a violation that the Independent Ethics Board is empowered (or has jurisdiction) to investigate.** Upon second by Mr. Howard Kessler, the vote on the motion was as follows:

AYE: Ernie Paine, Howard Kessler, Bruce Strouble, Chantelle Dorsey, Bugra Demirel

NAY: Elaine Bryant, Sha'Ron James, Jared Willis, Beth Corum

The motion passed 5 - 4.

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **recommend a Charter amendment to define the Independent Ethics Board's jurisdiction over the mayor and commissioners to include their duties while sitting as external Board members of outside governmental agencies.** Upon second by Dr. Bruce Strouble, the vote on the motion was as follows:

AYE: Elaine Bryant, Ernie Paine, Howard Kessler, Jared Willis, Beth Corum, Bruce Strouble, Chantelle Dorsey, Bugra Demirel

NAY: Sha'Ron James

The motion passed 8 - 1.

Ms. Sha'Ron James clarified that while she supported both concepts, she voted in opposition to the proposals due to insufficient time to fully vet each issue.

Mr. Jared Willis moved to **withdraw the proposal to consider single-member districts.** Mr. Ernie Paine seconded the motion.

Dr. Bruce Strouble offered a friendly amendment to also include the **withdrawal of the proposal to consider reclassifying the Police Chief position to an Appointed Official position.**

Upon acceptance of the friendly amendment by Mr. Willis and Mr. Paine, the **vote on the amended motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

The amended motion passed, thereby removing the additional proposals of an appointed police chief and single-member districts from further consideration by the committee.

Committee discussion ensued regarding reconsidering the earlier votes pertaining to the powers and duties of the Independence Ethics Board, for the express purpose of having the permanent record reflect unanimous endorsement of the Ethics recommendations.

Mr. Howard Kessler moved to **reconsider the vote regarding whistleblower complaints.** Upon second by Mr. Bugra Demirel, the **vote on the motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

The motion to reconsider the earlier action passed.

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **recommend a Charter amendment that the Independent Ethics Board be designated by the City Commission as the “appropriate local official” with the authority to receive and investigate complaints and disclosures under F.S. 112.3187, as it may be amended from time to time, when such complaints or disclosures name the mayor or their staff, the commissioners or their staff, or the Inspector General or their staff, and allege a violation that the Independent Ethics Board is empowered (or has jurisdiction) to investigate.** Upon second by Ms. Sha’Ron James the **vote on the motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

Ms. Beth Corum moved to **reconsider the vote regarding IEB jurisdiction over outside agencies.** Upon second by Ms. Chantelle Dorsey, the **vote on the motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

The motion to reconsider the earlier action passed.

Mr. Ernie Paine moved to **recommend a Charter amendment to define the Independent Ethics Board’s jurisdiction over the mayor and commissioners to include their duties while sitting as external Board members of outside governmental agencies.** Upon second by Ms. Sha’Ron James, the **vote on the motion was unanimous in favor thereof.**

There being no further business before the 2024 Charter Review Committee, several board members took a moment of personal privilege to thank the committee, as a whole, and staff, for their efforts, noting that the committee maintained a collegial attitude and decorum throughout the committee’s deliberations.

The meeting adjourned at 8:00 p.m.